

**Dublin City Council**

**Audit Committee**

**Minutes of Meeting held on 14<sup>th</sup> March, 2019 at 8.00 a.m.  
in the Richard O'Carroll Room, City Hall**

**Attendance:**

**Members**

Mr. Brendan Foster, Dublin Chamber of Commerce, Chairperson (BF) (Chair)  
Ms. Louise Ryan, Trinity College Dublin (LR)  
Mr. Johnny McElhinney, Docklands Business Forum (JMCE)  
Mr. Nathy Walsh, Institute of Public Administration (NW)  
Lord Mayor Councillor Nial Ring (LM)  
Councillor Naoise O Muiri (Clr. O Muiri)

**Officials:**

Ms. Kathy Quinn, Head of Finance (KQ)  
Mr. Hugh Fitzpatrick, Head of Internal Audit (HF)  
Ms. Martina Mc Loughlin, Senior Staff Officer, Internal Audit

**1. Minutes of Audit Committee meeting held on 13<sup>th</sup> December, 2018.**

The outstanding Actions from previous meetings were discussed, as follows:

HF informed the Members that the Audit Committee's Work Programme & Charter for 2019 were approved by the City Council at the January 2019 Council meeting.

HF also updated the Committee on the action items relating to issues on (1) Procurement and (2) Drivers' Records.

BF referred to the lack of staff resources in the Internal Audit Unit and said that this had been consistently raised as an issue by the Committee.

The minutes were agreed.

**2. Standing Item on the agenda – Any Conflict of Interest of A.C. Members**

No conflict of interest was declared.

**3. Progress report on the implementation of Internal Audit's recommendations, (relating to the two reports discussed at the December meeting, i.e. "Review of Joinery Workshop" and "Review of DCC Properties Leased/Licensed to Community Groups in the Central Area")**

The Committee discussed the response dated the 13<sup>th</sup> March, 2019 from the Executive Manager, Housing & Community Services Department and agreed that it was unacceptable in relation to the implementation of recommendations contained in the Joinery Workshop Audit Report.

The Members were not satisfied with the term “considered prohibitive” under the response to Recommendation 7.3, and sought the basis on which this determination was made. They agreed that a report/analysis should have been undertaken, to support the conclusion reached. Also, they questioned the statement that there are “better ways to assess the relative value for money” under the response to Recommendation 7.3 and asked that these “better ways” be formally outlined to the committee.

The Committee agreed that a response should be forwarded to the Housing & Community Services Department outlining the Committee’s concerns and that this issue be kept on the agenda for the next Audit Committee.

**Action 1: HF to draft letter to the Assistant Chief Executive, Housing & Community Services Department, outlining the Members concerns, for approval and signature by the Chair of the Audit Committee**

**Action 2: This issue to be included on the agenda for the new Audit Committee**

**4. 3 Local Government Audit Service (LGAS) reports:**

- **An Overview of Commercial Rates in Local Authorities, December 2018**
- **An Overview of Pension Income and Costs in Local Authorities, December 2018**
- **Progress Rpt. No.8 - Progress on the implementation of the recommendations contained in VFM Report No. 30, December 2018**

HF gave a brief summary of each of the three Reports.

The Committee noted the Reports.

**5. Draft Report of the Audit Committee in accordance with the Local Government (Audit Committee) Regulations 2014, Regulation 15(1), detailing its consideration and findings for the year 2018, etc.**

The draft report was approved by the Members, for submission to the City Council.

**Action 3: HF to submit report to April meeting of City Council.**

**6. Internal Audit Report R09-18: Review of Business Continuity Planning for the Traffic Signal Control System – Sydney Coordinated Adaptive Traffic System (SCATS)**

HF presented the report by Deloitte and outlined the main findings, two of which were significant, resulting in the system being graded as “Weak”. This was attributable to the lack of management and testing of the Business Continuity Plan and some issues relating to the SCATS server room (physical access and environmental controls).

**7. Internal Audit Report R10-18: Software Asset Management Review**

HF presented the report by Deloitte and outlined the main findings and the rating of the audit report as “Needs Improvement”. That is attributable to the situation pertaining to software asset management within the Eastern Regional Control Centre, operated by Dublin Fire Brigade.

All other software being used by DFB, i.e. in DFB Headquarters by administrative and operational staff, training centre etc. is managed by the Corporate I.S. Department.

The Committee expressed its concern of a notable trend across audit matters presenting to the committee relating to DFB. There are indications of a divergence of compliance in DFB in relation to governance and oversight of DCC's Corporate Policies. It was agreed that this would be an appropriate matter to have reviewed by the next audit committee, as a result of recent findings.

**Action 4: Consideration to be given by the next Audit Committee to include a governance review of Dublin Fire Brigade on the 2020 Internal Audit Plan**

**8. A.O.B**

KQ thanked the outgoing Committee and said all their hard work was greatly appreciated. BF thanked IA and HoF in turn.

NOM to suggest, at the next meeting of the Corporate Policy Group, that the external Members of the current AC who wish to continue as Members on the next AC, should be facilitated.

**Action 5: NOM to raise issue re external Members for next meeting of the Corporate Policy Group.**

Next meeting: To be decided by the next Audit Committee when established, post Local Elections on the 24<sup>th</sup> May, 2019.

The meeting concluded at 9.15am.

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Chairperson

Date: 7-11-19

## Appendix A

### Actions agreed at this Audit Committee Meeting

- Action 1:** HF to draft letter to the Assistant Chief Executive, Housing & Community Services Department, outlining the Members concerns at the latest response relating to the Joinery Workshop Audit, for approval and signature by the Chair of the Audit Committee
- Action 2:** This issue to be listed on the agenda for the inaugural meeting of the next Audit Committee
- Action 3:** HF to submit report to April meeting of City Council.
- Action 4:** Consideration to be given by the next Audit Committee to include a governance review of Dublin Fire Brigade on the 2020 Internal Audit Plan
- Action 5:** NOM to raise issue re external Members for next meeting of the Corporate Policy Group.